

The (in)validation of memory – Supplementary Material

Table X. Sample sizes of studies.

	Scoboria et al. (2015)*	Goldstein & Farmer (1993)	Nelson & Simpson (1994)	Pendergrast (1995)	McElroy & Keck (1995)	Lief & Fetkewicz (1996)	de Rivera (1997)	de Rivera (2000)	Ost et al. (2001)	Ost & Nunkoosing (2010)	Maran (2010)
<i>N</i>	374	8	20	9	1	40	4	56	20	1	1
Social feedback	158										
Event plausibility	73										
Alternative attributions	33										
General beliefs re: memory	24										
Internal memorial characteristics	27										
Notions of self / others	24										
External	27										
Personal motivation	4										
Other	4										
New categories											
Age of NBM event											
Age at Belief withdrawal											

Notes: Articles and chapters by Davis (2005), de Rivera (1998), Fetkewicz, Sharma & Merskey (2000), Ost, Costall & Bull (2002), Woodiwiss (2010) and Ashmore & Brown (2010) are not included in Table X because, although they refer to individuals who have retracted beliefs or memories of abuse, they either do not focus on – or contain little information about – the self-reported *process* of retraction. * These frequency data are taken from Table 2, column 3 of Scoboria et al. (2015, p. 8).

Coding of examples from sources

	Data (<i>and source, e.g., FMSF</i>)	Sample size	'Causes of retraction? Of true(?) childhood memories	'Causes' of retraction? Of 'false(?)' childhood memories	Recovery vs. retraction	Notes
Goldstein & Farmer (1993) book	Anecdotal case studies (<i>unclear – likely FMSF</i>)	N=8 (incl. Laura P)	Emotionally-draining conferences ... with my pastor (p. 224)	“Memories not mine”	Gradual 'recovery' and gradual 'retraction'	“I wrote long stories about what I thought might have happened to me and when I finished I couldn't believe it was true. Often I told my therapists that these things were lies but I was encouraged to believe them and to 'act as if.' This, I was convinced, would be recovery” (p. 229)
			Hospitalisation (p. 227)	self-esteem work with different therapist (p. 230)		
			“My days were filled with taking drugs that sometimes altered my ability to understand what was happening to me, group therapy, listening to others' stories of abuse and various visualizations and individual therapy,” (p. 228)	read magazine article ('Presumed guilty' in 'Changes' magazine, p. 232)		
			Therapy beginning in 1988, then 12 steps program, then new therapy started 1990, “after only two sessions with Sue, I admitted myself into a psychiatric center” (p. 242). Doctors there did not suggest abuse but she was discharged with “unresolved sexual abuse” to be dealt with as an outpatient. Read CTH & workbook. Back into therapy (“still had no concrete memory of any sexual abuse, but according to every staff member at the hospital who cared for me, I had all the symptoms of a	“Who made her God?” read column by Darrell Sifford (“These columns were practically an account of what had happened to me,” p. 248)	Reluctant / lengthy 'recovery' vs. rapid retraction	belief without memories (“It must be true, but I had no memories – no memories at all,” p. 235; “still had no concrete memory of any sexual abuse,” p. 245) until finally discussed memory of being bathed as a baby in the kitchen sink (“Inside I felt that these 'memories' were all fabrications, but I felt helpless and trapped,” p. 247)

			<p>'survivor"', p. 245)</p> <p>"In the past two years I had been very wrapped up in reading 'self-help' books about recovery" (p. 253). Then treatment with psychologist who "kept asking me about my childhood" (p. 253). "After about seven days of intense brainwashing sessions with my therapist, feeling extraordinarily pressured to 'remember' a single incident that would explain everything, I had a mental breakdown." (p. 257)</p>	<p>"My recovery from 'recovery'"</p> <p>Doubts after calling a psychiatry phone in program ("He [David Viscott] said that I had made a terrible mistake and that I needed to apologize to my parents for the accusation," p. 262) but therapist convinced her that was wrong.</p> <p>Took a Psychology class, read In the Palaces of Memory (George Johnson) which contradicted what she had been told in therapy, "Slowly, the thought was beginning to surface that maybe this sexual abuse belief just might not be true," (p. 272).</p> <p>To stop her committing suicide she booked herself to the local state hospital and, after helping a catatonic girl, "I told hospital staff that I had falsely accused my father of sexually abused me as a child and they seemed incredulous at this," (p. 276).</p> <p>"I figured out in the hospital that I had been horribly duped and that everything had been a figment of my imagination – all the abuse, all the murders, and especially the rape by my father," (p. 279).</p>	<p>Reluctant admission to CSA following being sectioned – in order to get out.</p> <p>But constant struggle to 'remember' any details ("I was always trying to get her to relate the details of her abuse (thinking it would help be remember mine) ...," p. 268).</p> <p>Visiting a hypnotherapist led her to relive "the supposed rape scene and many others, including being molested on the changing table at the age of one," (p. 271). At first session was told she had MPD.</p> <p>Attempted to 'retract' more than once. Retraction therefore a gradual process?</p>	<p>Section headed, "A false belief is implanted," p. 252.</p> <p>Read self-help books prior to any treatment.</p> <p>"My therapist asked me several times if I had ever been touched in a sexual manner. I replied, 'No, not that I remember.' He placed great emphasis on this possibility, as though I were withholding something very important that would explain my emotional problems" (p. 254)</p> <p>"the extent of my 'memories' which at that time consisted of only 'body memories', a pelvic sensation that I believed was sort of an echo of past sexual abuse," (p. 265)</p> <p>After setting up a self-help group of her own (12 members), "I believe that many in my group had false beliefs and a few had really detailed false memories. There were also women in my group who really had been sexually abused," (p. 266)</p> <p>Author started a newsletter called "The Retractor".</p>
			<p>Told had symptoms of CSA survivor in marriage counselling session (p. 287). Spent a week trying to remember (p. 288). Hypnotic suggestion (p. 290). Therapist insisted he was "95 percent sure my dad had sexually</p>	<p>"Surviving 'therapy'"</p> <p>Family photograph instilled initial doubt that the visualizations were true (p. 322).</p> <p>Read newspaper article about FMS (p. 330).</p>	<p>"It still didn't feel like a real memory, but [therapist] still insisted it was real," (p. 292)</p> <p>"I could not remember anything in a way that felt real to me that indicated he [her father] had [abused her]," (p. 293).</p>	<p>Bad eyesight caused by sexual molestation? "she spontaneously asked me what I didn't want to see when I was a child that caused my eyesight to weaken so that I had to start wearing glasses," (p. 305).</p>

			abused me" (p. 292).		Four years since start of therapy with Tom (p. 314) with new therapists following, but still no memories, then hypnotherapy and visualization of mother sexually abusing her (p. 316).	
			Three months of therapy for an eating disorder, then father died and put on anti-anxiety medication (p. 333). Generated symptoms of paranoia and a feeling of something stuck in her throat. Therapist then hit her with a "bombshell" (p. 334) that she knew she had been abused between the ages of 4 and 6.	"The truth set me free"	Unclear. A spiritual realization, "A loud voice inside me said, 'you were not abused by your father. It's a LIE. It's all a lie!' I believe now that it was the Lord speaking to me in His loud voice."	Had always recalled molestation from between ages of 9 and 14.
			Hypnosis "week after week, session after session", followed by a flashback whilst hoovering (p. 351). "Every flashback I had was judged to be actual, factual data from my past" (p. 351). The put on Xanax (mild sedative, p. 352). Became dependent on therapist (p. 353)	"Misplaced trust" (Laura P) Read an article on a family who had been accused of abuse by their daughter (p. 361).	Four years of therapy. Quick retraction.	Did get "memories" (p.p. 353-4), "The visions in my head were of severe physical and sexual abuse. The images were so incredibly bizarre but seemed so real." All kinds of crazy satanic stuff from other folks' flashbacks.
			Genuine memories reinterpreted by therapist ("the fact that I didn't like my mother washing my hair when I was eight or nine was seen as an indication that my mother had done more than wash my hair in the bathtub," p. 369) Interpreting the colours used to draw pictures (e.g.,	"Traumatic therapy" "What allowed me to realize that the 'memories' of abuse by my parents were not true was time away from the therapy group ... [T]he group pressure to trust the memories and to believe was just too strong to resist," (p. 384).		Had always remembered an incidence of sexual abuse by her uncle.

			using red meant she was “drawing the blood that my father made me drink after he cut me with a knife,” p. 376)			
			Ten weeks in hospital, culminating in ‘diagnosis’ of MPD (p. 388). Attended MPD group (p. 389)	“Diagnosed as MPD” Getting away from the Doctor (p. 405).		
Nelson & Simpson (1994)	Survey (pilot via FMSF, main telephone survey not – subjects were located by probing an informal network of people reporting similar experiences related to memory recovery)	N=20 (1=male)	90% reported at least one ‘trance induction’ technique (e.g., hypnosis, regression, trance writing, sodium Amytal) (p. 125)	No information about ‘causes’ of retraction of ‘false’ beliefs <i>per se</i> other than a couple of quotes from respondents. “The therapists put me in the hospital for 8 weeks until I remembered SRA [Satanic Ritual Abuse]. (Finally) I mimicked SRA flashbacks because I had seen them a hundred times in group. I did this to get out. I was out in one week and I never went back (to that group). I rejected the SRA memories immediately upon release” (p. 125). “Within two weeks of leaving therapy I realized that my memories were false” (p. 125). “When asked if they ever doubted the memories, all of the subjects reported that they did, with regular frequency” (p. 127).	The pattern that emerges here seems to be one of continually striving and being pressured (but being unable) to ‘remember’ abuse, despite strong questioning and doubts about the validity of the claim. In one case, a respondent immediately retracted once she left hospital – so essentially never ‘remembered’ anything, just played along. Another realized two weeks after ending therapy that the memories were false.	“One subject never participated in therapy; all of her visualizations occurred after reading the book, <i>The Courage To Heal</i> ” (p. 124). “About half of the women in the group stated: ‘I have been sexually abused by my father, but I don’t have my memories yet ... ’” (p. 126).
Pendergrast (1996)	Case studies (unclear)	N=9 (incl. Laura P)	Self help book, looking at family photos, guided imagery (p. 350)	Olivia McKillop Confided in leader of youth group leader [Fran], “I’m sorry, but at the risk of you hating me, I have to say this. I’ve listened to you for the last four months, and I just don’t believe it. You’re the produce of bad counselling ... I didn’t believe	“Eventually, I came to believe that six men had abused me, including my grandfather, Dad, and my brother Jerry. Tricia [therapist] would take a real incident and help me turn it into something awful,” (p. 351)	“But I still have nightmare from these ‘flashbacks’. Sometimes I still say to myself, ‘Maybe something happened,’ just to give myself some peace,” (pp. 353-4).

				<p>her, but the seed of doubt was planted," (p. 352).</p> <p>Then, whilst acting as a camp counsellor, a young girl (10 y.o.) disclosed abuse to her, "And I thought to myself, 'My Dad did not rape me.' I was not like this child. She remembered. She always remembered. So we reported what she said to the authorities." (p. 353)</p>		
			<p>Transactional analysis, chair work, dreamwork, interpretation of 'body memories' (pp. 355-6)</p>	<p>Linda Furness</p> <p>After asking what 'body memories' were she became doubtful. "I said, 'Yes, but where is the scientific evidence for this?' He said, quite agitatedly, 'You must trust me.' ... I began to doubt it then." (p. 359)</p>	<p>"Eventually, I accepted that my father had abused me. I became very withdrawn," (p. 357)</p>	<p>"This is about belief, and it's up to me to choose what I want to believe. I don't <i>want</i> to believe that this is the truth." (p. 360)</p>
			<p>Christian counsellor, imagine inner child, hypnosis, flashbacks (p. 362)</p> <p>Year later, flashback of mom sexually abusing her with a coathanger (p. 363)</p> <p>Attended group sessions, overdosed on Xanax (p. 363)</p> <p>"Everybody in the group was encouraged to divorce their families and make the group their new family," (p. 364)</p>	<p>Lief and Pasley</p> <p>She told her therapist that she wanted to write a book about her experiences but he told her that she was not finished with her flashbacks, "And something snapped. I thought, 'Oh yeah, asshole, I am. Four years of getting worse is enough'" ... "Then one day in 1991, I read an article in a local magazine about false memory syndrome, with an interview with parents who had lost their daughter" ... "It was like a light came on in my head. When I realized what had been done to me, I called a good psychologist" (p. 365)</p>		<p>"It is only recently that I realized where those particular images came from. The enemas and insertion came from the book <i>Sybil</i>, and the upside down hanging came from a movie called <i>Deranged</i>, which I saw when I was 17." (p. 364)</p>
			<p>Reading self-help books, relaxation sessions (p. 367)</p>	<p>Maria Granucci</p> <p>So Tom [husband] and I agreed a withdrawal plan. I was off all the medication in four weeks.</p>	<p>"Finally, in April 1993, Karen [therapist] asked me if I was willing to discuss possible incest</p>	<p>"I never developed any specific times and places, but I was sure the abuse had occurred on a continual basis between the ages of 5 and 15,</p>

				<p>As I came off it, I started to become myself again, started to feel clear, real, tangible. I also stopped seeing Karen [therapist] during that time” (p. 369)</p>	<p>issues. She had groomed me for over four years to get to this point. In desperation to get well, I said I was willing to entertain the thought” (p. 367)</p> <p>“Then I would remember my father invading my safe spot by entering the room and closing the door behind him. I would picture him demanding that I take off my clothes. At first, I would remember him just looking at me. Then it proceeded to, ‘My God, he fondled me!’ Finally, as I got older in my memories, I realized that he repeatedly penetrated me” (p. 366)</p> <p>“I entered therapy in 1988 because of a job-related harassment issue, and I left in 1993 a suicidal wreck. It stole five years of my life” (p. 371)</p>	<p>when I met my future husband Tom: (p. 367)</p>
			<p>‘Exorcism’ by local vicar and his wife, interpreted visual imagery as memories. (P, p. 372)</p>	<p>Francine Boardman</p>	<p>“This [exorcizing demons] went on for one and half years. I finally stopped it” ... “They [pastor & wife] told me that I would have to see them for about five years, and that was when I decided, no, I would not. I got some strength from somewhere. I rang them up and said, ‘I’m not coming any more” ... “When I told them to go, it was in June of 1991. Gradually, I realized that all of my stories were just stories. None of it was true ... ” (p. 374)</p>	
			<p>Self help books, seminar delivered by incest survivor (p. 376), prayer and age regression (p. 377), journaling and interpreting body memory [choking] as indicative of abuse (p. 378)</p>	<p>Leslie Hannegan</p> <p>“After a year, I went to another Christian counsellor ... She said, ‘Well, what do you remember about this abuse?’ I said, ‘Not much.’ She asked. ‘Are you sure this really happened to you?’ I felt angry at first that she didn’t believe me, but she was just asking questions” (p.</p>	<p>Pastor gave sermon having seen programme on false memory syndrome. Pastor’s wife convinced her that she was having a nervous breakdown (p. 379)</p>	

				378)		
			Encouraged to read CTH, "Then, after about six months of weekly session, we started doing what he referred to as mild relaxation technique, which I've since learned was really hypnosis" Inner child work (p. 381)	<p>Nell Charette</p> <p>Friends noted that she was "looking like shite, not making any sense ...".</p> <p>"I finally met with Milt [therapist] one day outside the office and said, 'I can't handle it right now, I'm going to stop for a month, give myself a break.' He said, 'By all means,' because I wasn't planning to leave permanently ... The longer I stayed out of therapy, the more I started seeing it for what it was. The voices started disappearing from my head, that was a biggie" (p. 384)</p> <p>"Anyway, Milt's [therapist] boss was blown away by what I told him. He gave me a paper on false memory syndrome to read, to take home. He told me he didn't think I had MPD, that it was being created in me" (p. 385)</p>	"I went to see an independent psychiatrist, took a bunch of tests. He said I'm fine, that I did not have MPD, never did." (p. 385)	
			<p>Was in therapy to deal with always-remembered abuse. Went into hospital to deal with death of father. Therapists then, "turned so cold. In our sessions, he was hostile. He kept insisting that I close my eyes and picture my abuse." (p. 388)</p> <p>"All of us were given at least one addictive drug." (p. 389)</p>	Stephanie Krauss		
			Hypnosis: "At first, I went to see her once a week for	Robert Wilson	"I was so afraid of being out of control that I wouldn't leave	"After the relaxation sessions, we started doing hypnosis. I never remembered anything about it

			<p>an hour, but then it was two hours, and then two sessions a week, two hours each." Self help books. Was also on medication (Mellaril & thorazine) (p. 393)</p>	<p>my house ... During that year I stopped taking medication, and I started to feel better. I couldn't understand it" (p. 395).</p> <p>"Jill [sister] called and said, 'I saw this program. Would you please call this 800 number for the FMS Foundation?'" (p. 396)</p>		<p>afterwards. I felt like I just fell asleep, and when I woke up she had so much to tell me. She said my father raped me when I was six years old ... " (p. 394)</p>
McElroy & Keck (1995)	Case history (client)	N=1	<p>Told that her symptoms were 'clear evidence' she had been sexually abused, and instructed to draw pictures of anything that came to mind (p. 732)</p> <p><unable to recall></p> <p>Free association, read self-help book.</p> <p>"developed 'detailed memories' of her brother-in-law and his possible bisexual male lover raping her, and of her sister 'joining them' by putting a knife to her neck, pulling her dress up, and 'orally raping' her" (p. 732)</p> <p><therapist discontinued treatment but she has no relief from the initial symptoms so started seeing a second therapist></p> <p>"she tried to uncover further memories in psychotherapy ... not able to uncover any further abuse memories, not convinced that the initial 'memories' she had recovered were true" (p. 732)</p>	<p>"because she was unable to find any 'proof' that she had in fact been abused, she decided that the memories ... were 'false' and 'produced' by therapy" (p. 733)</p> <p>after six weeks of treatment symptoms went away, after a year the meds were discontinued.</p>	<p>Sought therapy in 1990, had two separate therapists, both of whom urged her to 'recover' memories. Saw M&K in 1992, a year later still experiences intrusion of false memories (so 1993 ish).</p> <p><i>Recovered memories but never truly believed them.</i></p>	<p>Had attempted to uncover repressed memories with two different therapists over two previous years</p> <p>"she felt 'confused' because she had no such memories ... was 'desperate for the thoughts to stop' and 'willing to believe anything to make the thoughts stop'." (p. 732)</p> <p>"not convinced that the initial 'memories' she had recovered were true" (p. 732)</p> <p>"she was continuing to experience these 'memories'; and that she initially did not reveal such 'memories' when asked if she had uncovered abuse memories because she had come to believe they were 'false' rather than 'recovered' prior to her evaluation with us." (pp. 731-2)</p> <p>Once intrusive thoughts were in remission with medication, "Ms. B continues to experience the intrusion of false memories approximately once per month, and states that her husband continues to think that there may be something 'wrong' with her that allowed her to develop such memories." (p. 733)</p>
Lief & Fetkewicz (1996)	Survey (FMSF)	N=40	Hypnosis, creative visualization	Not much info, despite there being open ended sections of the Q about (2) how they came		"I was scared not to remember. I had many, many doubts, but my therapist didn't respond well to my doubts" (p. 423)

			<p>"After arguing for two or three months with the therapist that I had no memories, I guess I broke. Then he got me to do hypnosis." (p. 425)</p> <p>Support groups (p. 428)</p> <p>Positive dependent transference on the therapist, needing an explanation for mental /emotional disturbances, therapy was salvation, developing an identity as a survivor (p. 430)</p>	<p>to question their memories and (6) how they knew that their memories were false.</p> <p>Some indications:</p> <p>"Finally I went into a treatment center and was diagnosed with obsessive/compulsive disorder, placed on medication, and exposed to Alcoholics Anonymous. Both have helped me slowly return to sanity" (p. 425)</p> <p>"Ran out of money, kicked out [of therapy] cold turkey, praise God!" (p. 426)</p> <p>"It didn't feel like regular memories to me. Certain aspects of the memories I knew were real ... but these were pieced together haphazardly, interwoven into a scene of sexual abuse that didn't feel real" (p. 427)</p>		<p>"I never wanted to believe that I had been abused by my mother and I doubted it all the time" (p. 423)</p> <p>"I had doubts all the time, but I was told that this was my denial, my not wanting to get well: (p. 424)</p>
de Rivera (1997)	Interview (via FMSF)	N=4				<p>Cites Herman & Harvey (1993), "In fact, patients tend to cling to their doubts long past the point where most impartial observers would be convinced" (p. 5).</p> <p>Of N&S, "Although all 20 retractors reported that they frequently had doubts about whether their memories were true, K. Olio (personal communication, March 3, 1994) pointed out that such doubts stand in contrast to the certainty sometimes involved in the pseudomemories induced by Loftus (1993) and the confidence in incorrect memories reported by Winograd and Neisser (1992)" (p. 273).</p> <p>"How could persons possibly ignore the memory of their own childhood, the contrary evidence of other family members, the deep feelings that exist between children and parents?" (p. 273)</p>
			<p>"In the third month of therapy (early 1989), the therapist raised the issue</p>	<p>Ann (p. 276→)</p> <p>... "After only 4 days, Ann missed her children and husband so much that she</p>	<p>{ "I was so desperate to find an answer ... It took a <i>long</i> time" (p. 279)</p>	<p>"Early in therapy, her therapist tried to get Ann to identify with the idea of multiple personalities, but Ann rejected that notion, although she did</p>

			<p>of whether Ann had been emotionally abused as a child," (p. 276)</p> <p>Ann denied forcefully – therapy went on for another year.</p> <p>After suffering a ruptured ovary, therapist made suggestion re: abuse again. Ann began to agree with her therapist's view that she was quite sick. Began to read self-help books (pp. 276-7).</p> <p>By 1993 began to withdraw from parents, became depressed, medication was increased (p. 277)</p> <p>October 1994, wrote letter to parents detailing allegations.</p> <p>Therapist encouraged Ann to leave her husband. (p. 278) – she moved out (planned for a month) but ...</p>	<p>changed her ticket and flew home" (p. 278)</p> <p>Husband confiscated medication ... "As Ann was weaned from the medication, she grew closer to her husband and realized that he trying to help her," (p. 278)</p> <p>Reconciled with mother.</p> <p>"About a month after her retraction, Ann made a halfhearted suicide attempt," (p. 278)</p>		<p>admit to having mood swings," (p. 279)</p> <p>Detailed allegations (p. 277) but not clear whether belief or memory.</p>
			<p>Attended Christian counselling conference where a speaker told them, "many of you who don't remember any kind of abuse are going to start remembering it," (p. 279)</p> <p>Rang a chord with her.</p> <p>Started writing all her thoughts in a journal (p. 279)</p> <p>Had a flashback of being smothered by something</p>	<p>Beth (p. 279 →)</p> <p>Began therapy with new therapist who asked her if she were sure about her claims.</p> <p>Pastor read about FMS and constructed a sermon around it, "Satan attempted to beguile people and one of his latest tricks was something called false memory syndrome," (p. 281)</p> <p>"... the pastor's wife confronted Beth stating, 'it did not happen to you ... God does not make people miserable to show them</p>	<p>Never had memories.</p>	<p>"Beth thought the abuser <i>must have been</i> the sitter she had when she was two," (p. 280, italics added)</p> <p>"when the therapist asked what specifically her father had done, Beth said she could not remember; she had sensations, felt things, and had dreams, but had no concrete details," (p. 280)</p> <p>(with 2nd therapist) "Beth became angry that the therapist would doubt her and said, 'Yes!' even though she still had no memory of any specific events. (Not that Beth's abuse story was really constructed to explain sensations and dream images.)" (p. 280).</p>

			<p>large.</p> <p>Then had a dream in which a monster with her father's face came into her room.</p> <p>Told her mother 2 weeks later. Beth referred to a Christian counsellor (who unsuccessfully tried age regression) (p. 280)</p> <p>After a few months of sessions therapist told Beth that she would not get better until she confronted her father.</p> <p>"When her father returned home, he seemed broken. Beth felt both sorrow and anger, sometimes feeling he must be innocent, sometimes feeling he was manipulating" (p. 280)</p>	<p>the truth," (p. 281) ... "Beth now knew it had not happened, and she wanted to ask for her father's forgiveness," (p. 281)</p>		
			<p>Therapy concentrated on negative aspects of childhood. Cath began to drink in the evenings. In early 1987 she was hospitalized and discovered she did not need alcohol. She asked the hospital psychologists if the results of tests she had taken indicated abuse, "He replied that although he had looked for that, he could see no indication of abuse," (p. 283)</p> <p>5 days before Christmas 1998 she slashed her wrists and ended up back in hospital. Therapist began relaxation</p>	<p>Cath (p. 282 →)</p> <p>In 1991 she read about a case in which a therapist had described her patient as 'her child' which set off warning bells.</p> <p>In 1992 Cath's mother died.</p> <p>Her marriage began to break down and they saw a family therapist. "The new therapist asked her if she had ever been sexually abused. Cath, 'looked at her and said, 'No, no,' and she believed me. Cath gradually weaned herself from the first therapist," (p. 284)</p>	<p>Six and a half years of 'trying' to remember (p. 284).</p>	<p>"At this point, the investigator remarked, "It doesn't sound like you ever really had memories of being abused. It sounds like you were kind of playing with the idea of being abused," (p. 284)</p>

			<p>techniques with her, when she went into a 'dream' state. In Jan 89 therapist admitted her to a hospital unit for sexually abused women."Cath was put into an incest survivors therapy group and found herself surrounded by women who were having flashbacks and 'body memories,'" (p. 283)</p> <p>After leaving hospital the therapy centred on these flashbacks (p. 283)</p>			
			<p>Experienced set of really tragic events. Had therapy with decent therapist but then insurance ended and she had to start therapy with a new therapist.</p> <p>"Shortly into this new therapy ... Doris has a 'physical flashback.' She described this as being similar to an epileptic seizure saying, 'My body just went spasmodic.' She had no thoughts or images." (p. 286)</p> <p>"The therapist kept telling her that her father had sexually abused her, and Doris stated, 'I felt crazy. I felt like a lunatic,'" (p. 286)</p> <p>Flashbacks led onto a narrative being developed about how "members of a cult took the baby from her to be killed," (p. 287) essentially taking a true event and recasting it for</p>	<p>Doris (p. 286 →)</p> <p>Refused medication (p. 288)</p> <p>Then phoned a friend who had been present at the birth of her daughter. "With the help of her friend she was able to piece together other real scenes so that she could make sense of her other flashbacks," (p. 288)</p>	<p>Unclear but retraction appears to have been more rapid than 'memory / belief recovery'</p>	<p>"Doris stated: 'You tell me that my father sexually abused me, orally abused me, and made me eat babies, and you don't want me to find the memories! I don't think so. I needed proof, and I thought the proof was in these memories that she said I would eventually get,'" (p. 287-288)</p>

			<p>the purpose of what?</p> <p>“During the next year, Doris was hospitalized 14 times. She said, “They diagnosed me as everything in the book.” (p. 287)</p> <p>“She felt that her therapist and the hospital staff did not want to allow her her feelings. They preferred to hear a narrative of satanic abuse,” (p. 287)</p>																	
de Rivera (1998)	Survey (159 persons contacted by FMSF, 56 responded)	N=56	This survey asked respondents to answer a number of statements about their therapy and then endorse one of three models (or combinations of such) of what might have happened to them (mind control, narrative, and role enactment).																	
Fetkewicz, Sharma & Merskey (2000)	Survey (sample of 20 people who had been diagnosed with MPD and hospitalized with it taken from FMSF database)	N=12	This survey is about the incidence of suicidal attempts.																	
de Rivera (2000)	Survey (159 persons contacted by FMSF, 56 responded)	N=56	Same respondents as 1998 chapter but focuses on nature of memories and process of retraction.	<p>n=28 (50%) specific magazine or newspaper articles or radio or TV programs.</p> <p>n=21 behaviour of therapist seemed too dogmatic or inconsistent</p> <p>n=4 friends had been influential</p> <p>n=3 husbands played a primary role by cutting back on medications</p>		<p>Table 1 below (p.381)</p> <table border="1"> <caption>Table 1 Number of Respondents Endorsing Contrasting Descriptions of “Memories” and Role Absorption</caption> <thead> <tr> <th>Description of “memories”</th> <th>Frequency (N = 56)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Based on disconnected images</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>More of a feeling that I had been abused; based on body sensations and disconnected images</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Like a story I was imagining</td> <td>13</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Had a lot of detailed, connected imagery</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Formed a coherent story with concrete details and feelings that seemed like a real memory</td> <td>21</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other (faked = 1, reported by therapist but not believed = 2, no answer = 2)</td> <td>5</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Description of “memories”	Frequency (N = 56)	Based on disconnected images	3	More of a feeling that I had been abused; based on body sensations and disconnected images	4	Like a story I was imagining	13	Had a lot of detailed, connected imagery	10	Formed a coherent story with concrete details and feelings that seemed like a real memory	21	Other (faked = 1, reported by therapist but not believed = 2, no answer = 2)	5
Description of “memories”	Frequency (N = 56)																			
Based on disconnected images	3																			
More of a feeling that I had been abused; based on body sensations and disconnected images	4																			
Like a story I was imagining	13																			
Had a lot of detailed, connected imagery	10																			
Formed a coherent story with concrete details and feelings that seemed like a real memory	21																			
Other (faked = 1, reported by therapist but not believed = 2, no answer = 2)	5																			

				<p>n=28 (50%) wrote about making specific comparisons that indicated contradictions between their memories and factual information.</p> <p>“Respondents often indicated that after they had separated from their therapists, they compared the recovered memories with events that had always been remembered and realized obvious contradictions or differences in the quality of the recovered memories,” (p. ?? crappy electronic document).</p>		
Ost, Costall & Bull (2001)	Survey (FMSF n=11 and BFMS n=11 – 2 excluded as illegible)	N=20			<p>Recovery quicker than retraction (in opposition to most of the case studies above).</p> <p>Lack of familiarity / context</p> <p>Recovered memories too detailed – or too vague</p> <p>Memories dependent upon therapy</p> <p>Rec Mems changed over time</p>	
Ost & Nunkoosing (2010)	Interview (contacted via BFMS)	N=1	<p>“There was no way, until I got ill, I had any beliefs at all about my dad abusing me. My husband was afraid that he, for some reason my ex-husband is convinced now that my dad did abuse me, but he’d have to admit that until I got ill, I’d never said anything to him or to anybody else, not to anybody. I had no beliefs at all until I’d got ill that I’d been abused.” (pp. 24-25)</p>	<p>“Then I had a period, for about six months, when I was very well, right in the middle of it, I suppose about five years, six years through my illness. I had about six months of being very well. And the beliefs started to go. I was (off) my antipsychotics, I was back living at home.” (p. 22)</p> <p>“Some friends, I-I would say my best friend didn’t ... But she didn’t believe he’d abuse me. She-she’s always said that.” (p. 23)</p>	<p>“I’ve spent eight years of absolute...it’s been absolutely a nightmare of an existence.” (p. 25)</p>	<p>“And, I think around that time (treatments with anti psychotic medications and ECT) that’s the counselling session started with my psychiatrist. And then I think that’s when these beliefs really started to come into place. And I had just <u>very amazingly strong beliefs</u>, that it definitely was my father by then.” (p. 17)</p> <p>“I remember something that <name deleted> said to me when I was here, that ermm “one way, the- the pieces of the jigsaw puzzle will either fit together or they won’t”. And I think that’s the thing that stayed most in my mind, and they didn’t fit. You know, that I had some really good memories of being little that just didn’t go with the other memories. They didn’t fit together at all. And the memories that I had when I was ill, although I couldn’t, I certainly can’t remember them anyway. I mean I remember when, when I was ill. I could tell you</p>

						<p>huge, vivid graphic detail of all this, I wouldn't even be able to do that now." (p. 27)</p> <p>"It is therefore entirely possible that, should Nicola become ill again, that a repressed memory narrative might once again become a useful explanatory device. This retractor could, in fact, retract her retraction." (p. 29)</p>
Maran (2010)	Anecdotal case study (book)	N=1	<p>Working on incest stories as a journalist – has dream (p. 71).</p> <p>Having been sitting in on Parents Reunited sessions with (alleged?) abusers: "I doubt myself and I think I'm being melodramatic and yet these dreams keep repeating that it's true And I keep writing incest articles" (p. 80).</p> <p>Argument with father re: her homosexuality strengthens her belief that he was controlling etc. (p. 96)</p> <p>Given copy of Courage to Heal (p. 105)</p>	<p>Saw new therapist "who believes in my clients" (but seems to have sat on the fence regarding the truth or otherwise of her beliefs) (p. 109)</p> <p>Told mother but she did not believe (p. 122).</p> <p>CtH advice was not working so stopped incest writing (p. 132).</p> <p>Read Ofshe & Watters piece in Mother Jones magazine (p. 138).</p> <p>Read Jeffery Victor's book, Satanic Panic (p. 142).</p> <p>"I had a choice to make. I could go on duking it out with my disbelief and my resentments until my head ... exploded. Or I could turn my attention to what really mattered, to the simple clarity of knowing what needed to be done and doing it" (p. 149)</p> <p>"... I watched the interviews with 'retractors' ... and wondered if 'retractor' would be the next label I wore" (p. 162)</p> <p>p. 163 – father had heart attack</p>		<p>Never really 'remembers' abuse?</p>

	Started writing all her thoughts in a journal, age regression, dreams (dR97, p. 279-80)	I	13
Other - media (?) - classified as 5. 'Searching for (being told to search for) additional cues'.	Read CTH & workbook (G&F, p. 245) Self help books about recovery (G&F, p. 253) Self help book (P, p. 350) Reading self-help books (P, p. 376) Self help books (P, p. 376) Encouraged to read CTH (P, p. 381) Read self help book (M&K, p. 732) Began to read self help books (dR97, pp. 276-7) Given copy of CTH (MM, p. 105)	I I I I I I I I I	9
Other - medication	My days were filled with taking drugs that sometimes altered my ability to understand what was happening to me (G&F, p. 228) Put on anti-anxiety medication (G&F, p. 333) They put me on Xanax (mild sedative) (G&F, p. 352) Overdosed on Xanax (P, p. 363) Was also on medication (Mellaril and thorazine) (P, p. 393) Medication was increased (dR97, p. 277)	I I I I I I	6
Other - context change	Hospitalization (G&F, p. 224) Ten weeks in hospital ... attended MPD group (G&F, pp. 388-389) Everybody in the group was encouraged to divorce their families and make the group their new family (P, p. 364) Began to withdraw from parents ... encouraged to leave her husband (dR97, pp. 277-8) Therapist admitted her to a hospital unit for sexually abused women (dR97, p. 283) During the next year she was hospitalized 14 times (dR97, p. 287)	I I I I I I	6

	Wade et al. (2014)*	Retractors literature **
<i>N</i>	1105	56
Search for physical evidence (Being presented with 'physical' or 'psychological' evidence)	37.5%	-- (14%)
Asking another person - family (Being told by another person - family)	27.0	-- (2%)
Asking another person - other (Being told by another person - other)	26.2	-- (16%)
Cognitive techniques (Memory recovery techniques)	3.5	7% (23%)
Searching for additional cues (Being told to search for additional cues / self help books)	5.9	-- (14%)
Other - medication	--	10%
Other - change of context	--	10%

Notes: * Percentages taken from p. 30 of Wade et al. (2014). ** Reasons do not sum to 56 because, in some cases, explicit quotes are used to summarise the experience of many different individuals and in other cases nothing is explicitly mentioned about what motivated the retraction (e.g. Lief & Fetkewicz, 1996).

Table X. Reasons for withdrawing belief in occurrence (same highlighting / coloured font / emphasis = from same data source)

Categories / reasons for attenuating belief in memory

Category		Description & brief example(s)	Tally
<i>Social feedback: Invalidating information is derived via social exchange(s)</i>			
SF1	Told did not occur	"He [new therapist] said that I had made a terrible mistake and that I needed to apologize to my parents for the accusation" (G&F, p. 262) [Group leader said] "... I just don't believe it. You're the product of bad counselling" (P, p. 352) [told mother but she said] "What you're saying is impossible ... Your father couldn't have done that to you" (MM2010, p. 122)	I I
SF2	Told happened differently	[phoned a friend who had been present at birth of daughter] "With the help of her friend she was able to pieve together other real scenes so she could make sense of her other flashbacks" (dR97, p. 288)	I
SF3	Told impossible		
SF4	Told unlikely / questioned	"She [another therapist] asked, 'Are you sure this really happened to you?'" (P, p. 378) [Therapist's boss] "was blown away by what I told him ... He told me he didn't think I had MPD, that it was being created in me" (P, p. 385) [Sister] "called and said, 'I saw this program. Would you please call this 800 number for the FMS Foundation?'" (P, p. 396) "The new therapist asked her if she had ever been sexually abused. Cath, 'looked at her and said 'No, no' and she believed me'" (dR97, p. 284) "... my best friends ... didn't believe he'd abused me. She's ... always said that" (O&N, p. 23) "I was starting to wonder about some of them when a friend called and told me to turn on a TV talk show" (O2000, p. 120)	I I I I I I
SF5	Told happened to someone else		
SF6	Disconfirming non-verbal feedback		
SF7	Told was not there		
SF8	Lack of corroboration		
SF9	Feedback not sought / provided		
SF10	Others unavailable		
SF11	Pressured by others	Behaviour of therapist seemed too dogmatic or inconsistent (dR2000, p. 382) "mistrust her therapist after his callous remarks regarding her mother's death, claiming that her therapist stated she would 'do better therapy now that she was dead'" (O2000, p. 120)	21 I
SF12	Refusal to discuss		
<i>Event plausibility: Information challenges the possibility that the event could have occurred in reality</i>			
PL1	Subjective	"They became too stupid - I could not be holding down a responsible job yet going out at night stabbing people, having sex with doctors, patients and all sorts" (O2000, p. 119) "The memories became more and more bizarre" (O2000, p. 119) "It was more to do with the fact that certain things did not fit into place" (O2000, p. 119)	I I I
PL2	Objective		
<i>Alternative attributions: Invalidating information comes from other source attributions that are implied to be confused with reality</i>			
AA1	Internal, asleep		
AA2	Internal, awake	"I figured out in the hospital that I had been horribly duped and that everything had been a figment of my imagination" (G&F, p. 279)	I
AA3	Other mental state		
AA4	External	"I realized where those particular images came from [Sybil & Deranged]" (P, p. 364)	I
<i>General beliefs: Invalidating information relies on general meta-memory attributions</i>			
GB1	Memory and age		
GB2	Memory integrity	[young girl disclosed abuse] "And I thought ... 'My Dad did not rape me ... this child always remembered'" (P, p. 353)	I

	questioning by new therapist)	"Finally I went into a treatment center and was diagnosed with obsessive / compulsive disorder, placed on medication and exposed to Alcoholics Anonymous. Both have helped me slowly return to sanity" (L&F, p. 425) [saw new therapist] "I'm tired of exploring.' ... 'It's bee years. I want to feel better now.'" (MM2010, p. 110)	I I
CC2	Leaving therapy - voluntary	"What allowed me to realize that the 'memories' of abuse were not true was time away from the therapy group ..." (G&F, p. 384) "Getting away from the doctor" (G&F, p. 405) "Within two weeks of leaving therapy I realized that my memories were false" (N&S, p. 125) "I also stopped seeing Karen [therapist] during that time" (P, p. 369) "The longer I stayed out of therapy, the more I started seeing it for what it was. The voices started disappearing from my head" (P, p. 384) "I quit therapy cold turkey, got a regular job at a local firm ... started doing regular things with regular people" (MM2010, p. 132)	I I I I I I
CC3	Leaving therapy - involuntary	"... my insurance company ... stopped certifying any more treatment and I was released" (P, p. 390) "Ran out of money, kicked out [of therapy] cold turkey, praise God!" (L&F, p. 426)	I I
CC4	Stopping medication	"I was off the medication in four weeks. As I came off it, I started to become myself again" (P, p. 369) "During that year I stopped taking medication, and I started to feel better. I couldn't understand it" (P, p. 395) "As Ann was weaned from the medication, she grew closer to her husband and realized that he was trying to help her" (dR97, p. 278) Refused medication (dR97, p. 288) Cutting back medication (dR2000, p. 382) "I was [off] my antipsychotics" (O&N, p. 22) "I also lowered my medications so that I could think more clearly and went off a medication that affects memory" (O2000, p. 120)	I I I I I I I
CC5	Isolated from family	"... after only 4 days, Ann missed her children and husband so much that she changed her ticket and flew home" (dR97, p. 278)	I
Noticing deterioration: Noting that treatment was not leading to an improvement in their condition			
ND1	Noticed themselves	"And something snapped. I thought, 'Oh yeah asshole I am [finished with the flashbacks]. Four years of getting worse is enough" (P, p. 365) "By 1990 I'd been following the instructions in <i>The Courage to Heal</i> for two years, with negligible results. I decided to try a different way to heal" (MM2010, p. 132)	I I
ND2	Noticed by others	"She [Pastor's wife] said, 'Leslie, you are having a nervous breakdown'" (P, p. 379) [Friends] "said, 'You're looking like shit, not making any sense, what are you doing?'" (P, p. 384)	I I

Notes: Obvious or likely overlap of cases: Laura P in G&F and P (only coded once). Leslie Hannegan (in P) and Beth (in dR97) look similar too (only coded once).

	Scoboria et al. (2015)*	Retractors literature **
<i>N</i>	374	~158 ***
Social feedback (12 sub categories)	158	31
Event plausibility (2 sub categories)	73	3
Alternative attributions (4 sub categories)	33	2
General beliefs re: memory (3 sub categories)	24	1
Internal memorial characteristics	27	4
Notions of self / others (2 sub categories)	24	0
External (2 sub categories)	27	43
Personal motivation	4	3
Other	4	2

Notes: * Taken from Table 2, column 3 of Scoboria et al. (2015, p. 8) and refer to the category judged as the 'primary' reason for withdrawing belief. In the retractor literature such a clear distinction is not possible to make and often several features are quoted as being primary. ** Reasons do not sum to 158 because, in some cases, explicit quotes are used to summarise the experience of many different individuals and in other cases nothing is explicitly mentioned about what motivated the retraction (e.g. Lief & Fetkewicz, 1996). *** Likely duplicates across studies – obvious ones only coded once (e.g., Laura P, Beth Rutherford).

New categories(?)		
Change of context	-	19
<i>-change of therapy (no direct questioning)</i>	-	3
<i>-leaving therapy (voluntary)</i>	-	6
<i>-leaving therapy (involuntary)</i>	-	2
<i>-stopping medication</i>	-	7
<i>-isolated from family</i>	-	1
Noticing deterioration	-	4
<i>-noticed themselves</i>	-	2
<i>-noticed by others</i>	-	2

New categories: Examples.

New categories	n	Exemplar
Change of context	19	
<i>Change of therapy (no direct questioning)</i>	3	"At this [new] hospital I gained a new outlook and began to trust my own intuitions" (Goldstein & Farmer, 1993 p. 230)
<i>Leaving therapy (voluntary)</i>	6	"Within two weeks of leaving therapy I realized that my memories were false" (Nelson & Simpson, 1994, p. 125)
<i>Leaving therapy (involuntary)</i>	2	"Ran out of money, kicked out [of therapy] cold turkey, praise God!" (Lief & Fetkewicz, 1996, p. 426)
<i>Stopping medication</i>	7	"I also lowered my medications so that I could think more clearly and went off a medication that affects memory" (Ost, 2000, p. 120)
<i>Isolated from family</i>	1	"... after only 4 days, Ann missed her children and husband so much that she changed her ticket and flew home" (deRivera, 1997, p. 278)
Noticing deterioration	4	
<i>Noticed themselves</i>	2	"By 1990 I'd been following the instructions in <i>The Courage to Heal</i> for two years, with negligible results. I decided to try a different way to heal" (Maran, 2010, p. 132)
<i>Noticed by others</i>	2	[Friends] "said, 'You're looking like shit, not making any sense, what are you doing?'" (Pendergrast, 1995, p. 384)

Memories versus beliefs

'Belief'	'Memory'	Example
?	No	"At this point, the investigator remarked, 'It doesn't sound like you ever really had memories of being abused. It sounds like you were kind of playing with the idea of being abused,'" (de Rivera, 1997, p. 284).
Yes	No	"I never developed any specific times and places, but I was sure the abuse had occurred on a continual basis between the ages of 5 and 15" (Pendergrast, 1995, p. 367)
Yes	Yes	"The visions in my head were of severe physical and sexual abuse. The images were so incredibly bizarre but seemed so real" (Pendergrast, 1995, p. 353-4).
No	Yes	"Ms. B continues to experience the intrusion of false memories approximately once per month..." (McElroy & Keck, 1995, p. 733)
No	?	"...the memories that I had when I was ill, although I ... certainly can't remember them anyway. I mean I remember when ... I was ill. I could tell you [in] huge, vivid graphic detail all of this, I wouldn't even be able to do that now" (Ost & Nunkoosing, 2010, p. 29)