

Detection of distal ulna and radius fractures using thermal imaging as a diagnostic tool on children in the Emergency Department setting.

By

Alan Charters M.A, BSc (Hons), PgDip ed, Rgn, Rscn, Rnt.

The thesis is submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Professional Doctorate in Health Science of the University of Portsmouth.

Submitted September 2014

Abstract

Aims of the study

The aim of this pilot study was to examine whether a full phase III study would be beneficial in determining whether thermal imaging can be used as a diagnostic tool to detect distal ulna and radius fractures in children who attend the emergency department with an injury to their wrist when compared with the gold standard of X-rays.

Methods: Following ethical approval and informed consent, patients meeting the inclusion criteria with injuries to their distal forearms were recruited in to this investigation. The pilot study design was a quasi-experimental controlled trial of 67 patients evaluating whether thermal imaging could detect fractures in children's distal ulna and radius. All patients enrolled into this trial were treated in accordance with the European Thermography Association standard for carrying out diagnostic studies using infra imaging (Clark & DeCalcina-Goff, 1997). All of the children enrolled into this study had thermal images taken of their injured arm (case) and their uninjured arm (control). The thermal imaging took place alongside the X-ray, ensuring that the same person conducted the positioning of the child's wrist, thus ensuring consistency in image capture. The child was then treated appropriately in accordance to the X-ray results. The data from the thermal imaging was not analysed for six-months post the child's attendance at the ED in order to reduce the chances of interpreter bias.

Results: The results from this study found that there was a statistically significant difference in surface temperature of the injured arm when compared to the control (mean difference 0.90°C, 95% CI: 0.72 to 1.07, $p < 0.0001$). The magnitude of the difference is significant enough to suggest that a pathological change had taken place. Thirty-one out of thirty four children diagnosed with fractures on X-ray showed a

surface temperature difference of 1°C or greater when compared with the control (mean difference = 1.28, 95%CI .889 to 1.689). When the fracture group was compared with the injured non-fractured group, a mean difference of 1.084 °C (95% CI = 0.62 to 1.54, $p < 0.0001$) was found. When compared with radiographs, thermal imaging returned a sensitivity of 91.18 % with a specificity of 87.85%; the sensitivity is increased to 96.7 % when the clinical examination is taken into account. In this study the likelihood ratio for the positive test was calculated to be 7.52 %. The negative likelihood ratio was calculated to be 0.1 %.

Conclusion:

This study has shown that thermal imaging may be useful in detecting fractures of the distal ulna and radius in children's wrists, however its diagnostic accuracy is questionable, returning a sensitivity of only 91.8% when compared with X-rays (96.8%) however, when used alongside clinical examination the results demonstrate a sensitivity of up to 96.7%. This study has demonstrated that thermal imaging can detect quantifiable differences in temperature, between an uninjured wrist, a soft tissue injury and a fracture. However its accuracy in diagnosing a fracture cannot be guaranteed and does not reach the accuracy of X-rays, which are considered to be the current diagnostic gold standard. A full phase III multi centered study would be useful in determining whether thermal imaging could be a useful adjunct to the diagnosis of fractures within the wider health care setting, to elucidate whether thermal imaging has a role in reducing the amount of unnecessary x-rays carried out on children with suspected fractures to their wrists.

Table of contents:

Preface

Abstract	I
List of contents	III
List of tables	V
List of figures	VI
Declaration	VII
Acknowledgement and dedication	VIII
Dissemination	IX

Chapter 1: Introduction and background

1.1 Introduction	1
1.1.1. Background of medical thermal imaging	4
1.1.2. The relationship of thermal imaging and human physiology	5
1.2. Introduction to study	7
1.2.1. The objective of a pilot study	8
1.2.2 Aims of the study	10
1.2.2 Definition of a diagnostic study	10
1.2.3. Objectives of the study	11
1.3 Physiology behind the inflammatory response to bone healing	11
1.4 Types of fractures	13
1.5 Summary	14

Chapter 2: Literature review

2.1 Search strategies	17
2.2 Thermal imaging for the detection of fractures	20
2.2.1. The use of thermal imaging in the medical diagnosis of fractures	29
2.2.3. Further alternatives to X-ray.	39
2.2.4 Limitations associated with thermal imaging	41

Chapter 3: Research design and sampling

3.1 Conceptual framework	45
3.2 Research question	47
3.3 Standard approach to infrared Imaging	49
3.3.1 Location of thermal imaging	50
3.3.2. The imaging system	50
3.3.3 Patient manipulation	51
3.3.4 Report generation and data capture	52
3.4 The research design	53
3.5 The Quasi-experimental design	54
3.6 Methodology	55
3.7 Population and sample	57
3.7.1 Inclusion criteria:	58
3.7.2 Exclusion criteria:	58
3.8 The Clinical trial	59

3.9	Data Collection	63
3.10	Analysis of the data	63
3.11	Ethical issues	65

Chapter 4. Results and data analysis

4.1	Introduction	70
4.2	Demographic data	70
4.2.1	Results form the Data Collection Forms	72
4.2.2.	Inclusion criteria met	75
4.3	Results from the thermal imaging data	75
4.3.1	Study group versus control (Uninjured arm)	76
4.4	Study group: Fractured wrist compared with injured non -fractured group	79
4.5	Fracture group compared with control (Uninjured wrist)	81
4.6	Non fractured Injury group compared with control (Uninjured wrist)	83
4.7	Sensitivity and specificity	85
4.8	Likelihood Ratios	85
4.9	Summary	87

Chapter 5 : Discussion

5.1	Introduction	89
5.2	Primary objective for this study	89
5.3	Secondary objectives for this study	101
5.4	Limitations	105
5.5	Could thermal imaging be used as a screening tool	110

Chapter 6: Conclusion

6.0	Conclusion	114
6.1	Summary	116
6.1.1	Key findings	117
6.2	Implications for practice	118
6.3	Dissemination of findings	119

Chapter: 7 Reflections on the doctorate programme

Bibliography	127
--------------	-----

Appendices:	145
-------------	-----

List of tables

Table 2.1: Discounted papers	21
Table 2.2: Methodology for assessing diagnostic accuracy	22
Table 2.3: Summary of the papers reviewed within this chapter	23
Table 4.1: Demographic data	72
Table 4.2: Summary of the clinical data (Fracture group)	73
Table 4.3 Summary of clinical data (soft tissue group)	74
Table 4.4: Inclusion criteria	75
Table 4.5: Study group versus control	76
Table 4.6: Summary of results: study Group VS control	78
Table 4.7: Comparison of fracture group with non fracture injury group	79
Table 4.8: Summary of results: fracture VS non fracture (Injury group)	80
Table 4.9: Children with fractures compared with the control	81
Table 4.10: Summary of results comparison of fractures VS control	82
Table 4.11: Non- fractured injury group VS Control	83
Table 4.12: Summary of results non Fractured group VS control	84
Table 4.13: Sensitivity and specificity of thermal imaging when compared with X-rays	85
Table 4.14: Likelihood Ratios	86

List of figures:

Figure 1: Limb Segment Model.	6
Figure 2: X-ray of a child's wrist demonstrating a Buckle fracture	13
Figure 3: Classifications of fractures	13
Figure 4: Flow diagram of the literature review process	20
Figure 5: Conceptual framework	46
Figure 6: Example of thermal image	53
Figure 7: Patient journey through the department preceding trial	61
Figure 8: Flow chart of clinical trial	62
Figure 9: Flow diagram: Patients enrolled into pilot study	71
Figure 10: A Nomogram for applying Likelihood ratios	98

Declaration

Whilst registered as a candidate for the above degree, I have not been registered for any other research award. The results and conclusions embodied in this thesis are the work of the named candidate and have not been submitted for any other academic award.

Word count: 33420

Acknowledgement and Dedication

I would like to thank the parents and children that attended the emergency department and helped so enthusiastically with this study. Without them none of this research paper would have been possible.

I am indebted to Mr Simon Mullet clinical directors of the Emergency Department Mr Simon Hunter and Isobel Gaylard, clinical leads for the division of Emergency Medicine, for their unending support and encouragement.

I am very grateful and recognise the immense support that Dr Isobel Ryder and Professor Graham Mills have shown me throughout my whole Doctoral experience.

I would also like to thank the patient and understanding staff of the children's emergency department who have badgered and encouraged me to complete this study over the many years it has taken to complete.

Dissemination:

Charters, A (2012) Detection of fractures in children's wrists using thermal imaging as a diagnostic tool. Wessex Emergency Care Committee Autumn conference, September 2012.